### ORIGINAL APPLICATION ST. NO.1910/2018 (Ramrao Pallewad V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

### **OFFICE ORDER**

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Hemant Surve learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.S.Mahajan learned Chief Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. The applicant has challenged the suspension order dated 05-11-2018 issued by the respondent no.2 by filing the present O.A.
- 3. Advocate for Learned the applicant submitted that respondent no.2 has passed the impugned order and the appeal as provided under the Maharashtra Civil Services (Discipline & Appeal) Rules, 1979 ["MCS (D & A) Rules" for short] lies with the same authority. Therefore, applicant apprehends that no justice will be given to him in case he prefers the appeal before same authority, and therefore, the applicant has approached this Tribunal without availing remedy available to him under the MCS (D & A) Rules.
- 4. The suspension order issued under Rule 4 is an appealable order in view of Rule 17 of the MCS (D & A) Rules. Appellate authorities are provided in Rule 18 of

the MCS (D & A) Rules. Not only this but in view of the provisions of Rule 4(5) of the MCS (D & A) Rules, person aggrieved by the order can make representation before same authority or higher authority to which the authority is subordinate.

- 5. Abovesaid rules provide alternate remedy for challenging the suspension order. The applicant has not availed the alternate remedy available to him under the service rules. Since the applicant has not availed the alternate remedy available to him for redressal of his grievance, the O.A. cannot be admitted in view of S.20 of the Administrative Tribunals Act, 1985.
- 6. Since the application is not maintainable in view of S.20 of the Administrative Tribunals Act, the O.A.St.No.1910/2018 stands rejected. Case stands disposed of accordingly without any order as to costs.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.881/2018 (Dr. Manohar Jadhav V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_

OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Ashish Rajkar learned Advocate holding for Shri S.D.Joshi learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Priya Bharaswadkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 07-01-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.973/2018 (Rajaram Mohite V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

**OFFICE ORDER** 

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER**:

Heard Shri A.D.Gadekar learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Priya Bharaswadkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned Advocate for the applicant submitted that the applicant intends to file application for condonation of delay caused for filing the O.A. and he prayed for leave to file M.A. Leave as prayed for is granted.
- 3. Case be removed from the board.

MEMBER (J)

M.A.No.516/2018 IN O.A.St.No.3054/2018 (Kalpana Jagdhane & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri P.V.Suryavanshi learned Advocate for the applicants and Smt. Priya Bharaswadkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. This M.A. has been filed for sue jointly. Since the applicants have prayed for similar relief and cause of action is same and for the reasons mentioned in the applicant, M.A.No.516/2018 is allowed. M.A. stands disposed of accordingly without any order as to costs.
- 3. O.A. be registered and numbered as per procedure after removal of office objections, if any.

MEMBER (J)

O.A. St. No.3054/2018 (Kalpana Jagdhane & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

DATE : 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Heard Shri P.V.Suryavanshi learned Advocate for the applicants and Smt. Priya Bharaswadkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Issue notice to the respondents, returnable on 15-02-2019.
- 3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- 4. Applicants are authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.
- 6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained

and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicants are directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.

- 7. If notice is not collected within 7 days or proof of service is not produced before 3 days of the next date, case shall automatically stand dismissed without further reference to the Tribunal.
- 8. S.O. to 15-02-2019.
- 9. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.793/2017

(Abdul Rahman s/o. Abdul Rasheed Ansari V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri A.D.Gadekar learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.P.Gude learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 11-02-2019 for filing affidavit in rejoinder.

MEMBER (J)

### ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.849/2017 (Shashikala Gaikwad V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Smt. Suchita Dhongde learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.P.Gude learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 13-02-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.53/2018 (Sopan Patil V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

#### **OFFICE ORDER**

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri H.V.Tungar learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R.Bhumkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned Advocate for the applicant submits that applicant does not want to file affidavit in rejoinder. Hence, the case be fixed for final hearing.
- 3. S.O. to 13-02-2019.

MEMBER (J)

### ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.211/2018 (Dilip K. Mankeshwar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### **OFFICE ORDER**

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Smt. Suchita Dhongde learned Advocate for the applicant, Shri V.R.Bhumkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents and Shri S. B. Patil learned Advocate for respondent no.2.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 12-02-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.346/2018 (Vandana Koli V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

**OFFICE ORDER** 

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER**:

Heard Shri S.U.Chaudhari learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Priya Bharaswadkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned P.O. as per instructions received from the applicant has submitted at bar that the impugned transfer order has been withdrawn by the respondents, and therefore, she prayed to dispose of the O.A.
- 3. Learned Advocate for the applicant has also submitted that the order has been withdrawn and therefore he prayed to pass necessary order.
- 4. Learned P.O. seeks time to produce copy of the order withdrawing the impugned order.
- 5. At the request of learned Presenting Officers, S.O. to 10-01-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.351/2018 (Vishnu Gaikwad V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_\_

**OFFICE ORDER** 

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CODAM D D DAWN MEMBER (I)

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER**:

Heard Smt. Amruta Paranjape learned Advocate holding for Shri Joslyn Menezes learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R.Bhumkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned Advocate for the applicant on instructions states that the applicant does not want to proceed with the O.A. and she wants to withdraw the O.A. Therefore, she has prayed to dispose of the O.A. accordingly.
- 3. Learned P.O. has prayed to pass necessary order.
- 4. In view of the submission made by the learned Advocate for the applicant, O.A. stands disposed of as withdrawn with no order as to costs.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.368/2018 (Mokshada Garje V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER**:

Heard Smt. Amruta Paranjape-Menezes learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.P.Gude learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 07-01-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.369/2018 (Shaila Tele V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER**:

Heard Smt. Amruta Paranjape-Menezes learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali Deshpande learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, S.O. to 07-01-2019.

MEMBER (J)

### ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.390/2018 (Babu Dandegaonkar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Kakasaheb B. Jadhav learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.P.Gude learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

At the request of learned Presenting Officer,
 S.O. to 17-01-2019 for final hearing.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.478/2018 (Mariba Kamble V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

.\_\_\_\_\_

-----

CORAM: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Smt. Suchita Dhongde learned Advocate holding for Shri S.D.Dhongde learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali Deshpande learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned P.O. files affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent nos.1 and 3. It is taken on record. Copy thereof has been served on the other side.
- 3. S.O. to 12-02-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.503/2018 (Dr. Omprakash Kadam V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_

#### **OFFICE ORDER**

### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri J.S.Deshmukh learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali Deshpande learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

Shri A.B.Shinde learned Advocate for respondent nos.3 and 4 is **absent**.

- 2. Learned P.O. seeks time to file affidavit in reply. Time is granted as a last chance.
- 3. S.O. to 11-02-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.505/2018 (Suryakant Tatode V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri S.A.Wakure learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali Deshpande learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned P.O. states that she will file affidavit in reply during the course of the day. She also undertakes to serve copy of the reply on the other side.
- 3. S.O. to 07-02-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.523/2018 (Ravindra Deshmukh V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri V.H.Solanke learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.P.Gude learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned P.O. files affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent no.1 to 5. It is taken on record. Copy thereof has been served on the other side.
- At the request of learned Presenting Officer,
   S.O. to 08-01-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.757/2018 (Bhujang Shete V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### **OFFICE ORDER**

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri R.D.Biradar learned Advocate holding for Shri Shakil Shaikh learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali Deshpande learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned P.O. files affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent nos.1, 3, 4 and 5. It is taken on record. Copy thereof has been served on the other side. Learned P.O. states that reply of respondent no.2 is not necessary.
- 3. S.O. to 05-02-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.776/2018 (Nana Salunke V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri A.D.Sugdare learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R.Bhumkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned P.O. seeks time to file affidavit in reply on behalf of the respondents. Time is granted.
- 3. S.O. to 30-01-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.943/2018 (Suresh Bharti V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

#### **OFFICE ORDER**

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Ashish Rajkar learned Advocate holding for Shri S.D.Joshi learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Priya Bharaswadkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned P.O. seeks time to file affidavit in reply on behalf of the respondents. Time is granted.
- 3. S.O. to 29-01-2019.

MEMBER (J)

M.A.NO.373/2018 IN O.A.ST.NO.1652/2018 (Keshav Lohar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### **OFFICE ORDER**

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri A.D.Gadekar learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali Deshpande learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. Learned Presenting Officer seeks time to file affidavit in reply on behalf of the respondents. Time is granted.
- 3. S.O. to 12-02-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.186/2017 (Uday Asardohakar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Shri S.R.Barlinge learned Advocate for the applicant is **absent**. Smt. Deepali Deshpande learned Presenting Officer for respondents and Shri D.T.Devane learned Advocate for respondent nos.2 to 5 are present.

Applicant is present in person. At his request,
 S.O. to 05-02-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.395/2017 (Smt. Shobha Pathak V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Ashish Rajkar learned Advocate holding for Shri S.D.Joshi learned Advocate for the applicant, Smt. Priya Bharaswadkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents and Shri S.B.Mene learned Advocate for respondent nos.2 and 3.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 14-01-2019.

MEMBER (J)

O.A.NO.131/2018, 132/2018 & 159/2018 (Digambar Chothe & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

**OFFICE ORDER** 

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

-----

CORAM: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Smt. Vidya Taksal learned Advocate holding for Shri A.S.Deshmukh learned Advocate for the applicants and Smt. Priya Bharaswadkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, S.O. to 05-02-2019.
- 3. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.380/2018 (Dattatray Diwte V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Kakasaheb B. Jadhav learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.P.Gude learned Presenting Officer for respondents.

- 2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O.18-01-2019.
- 3. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.389/2018 (Ms. Archana Lathkar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Shri A.M.Nagarkar learned Advocate for the applicant is **absent**. Shri V.R.Bhumkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents is present.

2. None is present for the applicant. Case be placed for passing dismissal order on 29-01-2019.

MEMBER (J)

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO.437/2018 (Vijay Suralkar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_\_

**CORAM**: B. P. PATIL, MEMBER (J)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Shri Ram Shinde learned Advocate for the applicant is **absent**. Smt. Priya Bharaswadkar learned Presenting Officer for respondents is present.

- 2. None is present for the applicant.
- 3. Case be placed for passing dismissal order on 10-01-2019

MEMBER (J)

O.A.NOS. 212, 213, 214 & 215 ALL OF 2018 (Shri Ashok G. Labde & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_\_

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

-----

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Ms. Preeti R. Wankhade, learned Advocate for the applicants in all these cases and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents in all these cases.

2. Since Division Bench is not available, S.O. to 09.01.2019.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

ORAL ORDERS 03.01.2019-hdd

T.A.NO. 3/2018 (W.P.NO. 9260/2018) (Shri Mangesh R. Datar & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_\_

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

.----

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Ms. Preeti R. Wankhade, learned Advocate for the applicants and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Since Division Bench is not available, S.O. to 08.01.2019 for hearing.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

ORAL ORDERS 03.01.2019-hdd

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 439 OF 2018 (Shri Bhimrao N. Gaikwad Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

**OFFICE ORDER** 

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN
[The present case is placed before the
Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Girish N. Kulkarni, learned Advocate for the applicant and Mrs. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

- 2. At the request and by consent of both the parties, the present O.A. is being taken up for final disposal.
- 3. Learned Presenting Officer has filed the copy of the decision dated 01.01.2019 taken by the concerned respondent in reference to the earlier order passed by this Tribunal along with copy of communication dated 01.01.2019. The copies of the same are taken on record and marked as document 'X' for the purpose of identification. She submits that in view of the said decision nothing survives in the present O.A.
- 4. Learned Advocate for the applicant however, points out that though the decision is taken in favour of the applicant and it is communicated to him the said decision would show that only retiral benefits are

#### O.A. NO. 439 OF 2018

to be imparted and issue of grant of interest on delayed payment of the pensionary benefits is remained unanswered.

- 5. In the circumstances, the present O.A. is disposed of without any order as to costs with a direction to the concerned respondents to take steps of grant of retiral benefits at the earliest and in any case within a period of 8 weeks from the date of this order. The concerned respondents also initiate the process of fixing responsibility for unnecessarily initiating departmental enquiry against the present applicant and as to who shall be responsible for payment of interest. All these decisions also shall be rendered within a period of 4 months from the date of this order.
- 6. Steno copy and hamdust is allowed to both the parties.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

ORAL ORDERS 03.01.2019-hdd

O.A.NOS. 931 & 930 BOTH OF 2016 (Shri Chudaman D. Pawar & Anr. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN
[The present case is placed before the
Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Shrikant Patil, learned Advocate for the applicants in both these cases and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

- 2. Learned Advocate for the applicant has filed a copy of decision rendered by the Hon'ble High Court in W.P. No. 5814/2018 dated 23<sup>rd</sup> August, 2018, a reference of which was made in the earlier order passed by this Tribunal on 11.12.2018. The copy of the same is taken on record and marked as document 'X' for the purpose of identification.
- 3. Learned C.P.O. seeks time to take decision by the concerned respondents as was sought by him previously. At the request of learned C.P.O., S.O. to 06.02.2019 for reporting the decision taken by the concerned respondents in view of the decision in the W.P. No. 5814/2018.
- 4. Learned C.P.O. to act on steno copy.

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 848 OF 2017 (Smt. Ranipanchsheela S. Bansode Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

**CORAM**: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

1. Shri J.B. Choudhary, learned Advocate for the applicant has filed leave note.

2. Heard Shri Prafulla Bodade, learned Advocate holding for Shri J.B. Choudhary, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. Learned Presenting Officer for the respondents submits that the short affidavit is required to be filed. At his request, S.O. to 8.2.2019 for filing short affidavit.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

ORAL ORDERS 03.01.2019-hdd

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 833 OF 2018 (Shri Prashant A. Falke Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Heard Shri Naseem R. Shaikh, learned Advocate for the applicant and Mrs. Priya R. Bharaswadkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, S.O. to 11.02.2019 for filing affidavit in reply.

#### VICE CHAIRMAN

#### LATER ON

Learned Presenting Officer has filed affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 1 & 2 and the same is taken on record. He undertook to serve the copy of the same on the learned Advocate for the applicant.

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 570 OF 2016 (Shri Kamlakar P. Jaybhaye Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_\_

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

-----

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri S.A. Wakure, learned Advocate holding for Shri P.B. Rakhunde, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 06.02.2019 for hearing on the line of the order passed by this Tribunal on 5.12.2018.

VICE CHAIRMAN

O.A.NO. 800/2018 WITH O.A.NO. 903/2018 (Dr. Kirankumar L. Bondar & Anr. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

**OFFICE ORDER** 

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard S/Shri V.M. Chate & A.C. Deshpande, learned Advocates for the respective applicants in respective cases and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents in both these cases.

2. At the request of learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents, S.O. to 21.01.2019 for filing affidavit in reply in both these cases.

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 769 OF 2018 (Shri Pralhad C. Shelke Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

**OFFICE ORDER** 

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri U.S. Sawji, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents.

- 2. Learned C.P.O. has filed separate affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 3 and common affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 4 & 5 and the same are taken on record and copies thereof have been served on the learned Advocate for the applicant. He submits that presently affidavit in reply of respondent Nos. 1 & 2 is not required.
- 3. In the circumstances, S.O. to 01.02.2019 for hearing.

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 608 OF 2018 (Shri Narendra S. Suryawanshi & Anr. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

**CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN** 

......

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Shri R.P. Bhumkar, learned Advocate for the applicants has filed leave note. Shri M.P. Gude, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, present.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, S.O. to 12.02.2019 for filing affidavit in reply.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 115 OF 2018 (Shri Nagnath G. Savant & Anr. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

**Division Bench.)** 

: 03.01.2019 DATE

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Ashish Rajkar, learned Advocate holding for Shri S.D. Joshi, learned Advocate for the applicants, Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent Nos. 1 & 2 and Shri S.G. Kulkarni, learned Advocate holding for Shri Ajay Deshpande, learned Advocate for respondent No. 3.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, S.O. to 06.02.2019 for filing affidavit in reply.

#### VICE CHAIRMAN

#### LATER ON

Learned Presenting Officer has filed affidavit in reply on behalf of respondent No. 1 and the same is taken on record. He undertook to serve the copy of the same on the other side.

VICE CHAIRMAN

C.P.NO. 49/18 IN C.P.ST.397/17 IN O.A.539/16 (Shri Amol K. Kakde & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_\_

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

.-----

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri A.D. Gadekar, learned Advocate holding for Shri R.I. Wakade, learned Advocate for the applicants and Shri M.P. Gude, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicant, S.O. to 28.01.2019.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 517 OF 2017 (Shri Anup S. Kulkarni Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

**DATE** : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri S.B. Bhosale, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.P. Gude, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, S.O. to 24.01.2019, for filing affidavit in reply, as a last chance. Interim relief granted earlier to continue till then.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 540 OF 2016 (Shri Raghunandan D. Sapkale Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN The present case is placed before the

Single Bench due to non-availability of

**Division Bench.)** 

: 03.01.2019 DATE

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri S.G. Kulkarni, learned Advocate holding for Shri Ajay S. Deshpande, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri M.P. Gude, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

- 2. At the request of learned Presenting Officer, S.O. to 30.01.2019 for filing additional affidavit in reply.
- It is made clear that in case no additional 3. affidavit in reply is filed by the respondents on the next date, the present O.A. would be fixed for hearing.
- 4. Learned Presenting Officer to act on steno copy.

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 1 OF 2019 (Shri Laxman V. Bharde Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

OFFICE ORDER

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN
[The present case is placed before the
Single Bench due to non-availability of

\_\_\_\_\_

Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Advocate for the applicant and Mrs. Priya R. Bharaswadkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

- 2. Issue notice to respondents, returnable on 12.02.2019.
- 3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

#### O.A. NO. 1 OF 2019

- 6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. If notice is not collected within 7 days or proof of service is not produced before 3 days of the next date, case shall automatically stand dismissed without further reference to the Tribunal.
- 8. Learned Advocate for the applicant submits that the memorandum of charges of initiation of departmental enquiry were received to the present applicant on 27.11.2018 (Annexure 'A-2', page Nos. 22 to 38), while the present applicant was already superannuated on 31.5.2017. The charges would show that those are for the period of year 2004 to 2007 and, as such, as the memorandum is received after superannuation the disciplinary enquiry for the incident, which is occurred earlier to 4 years could not have been instituted or continued by the respondents. In the circumstances, without going into the merits of the case, interim relief in terms of prayer clause (a), which reads as under, is hereby granted until further orders.
  - "(a) Pending hearing and final disposal of this original application, the impugned memorandum of charges dated 25.04.2017 (Annexure "A-2") issued by

:: - 3 - ::

#### O.A. NO. 1 OF 2019

the respondent No. 1 to the applicant in respect of initiation of the departmental enquiry for the period from 02.08.2004 to 28.05.2007 as Sub Divisional Engineer, P.W.D. Sub Division, Degloor, may kindly be stayed."

- 9. S.O. to 12.02.2019.
- 10. Steno copy and Hamdast is allowed to both parties.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

O.A.NOS. 716, 634, 635 & 636 ALL OF 2018 (Shri Raghunandan D. Sapkale Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

**OFFICE ORDER** 

TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

**CORAM**: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN

[The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

**ORAL ORDER:** 

Heard Shri Ashish Rajkar, learned Advocate holding for Shri S.D. Joshi, learned Advocate for the applicants in all these cases and Shri M.S. Mahajan, learned Chief Presenting Officer for the respondents in all these cases.

- 2. Learned C.P.O. has filed separate affidavits in reply on behalf of respondent Nos. 1 to 4 in O.A. No. 716/2018, on behalf of respondent No.7 in O.A. No. 634/2018 and on behalf of respondent Nos. 3 & 4 in O.A. Nos. 635 & 636 both of 2018 and the same are taken on record. The copies thereof have been served on the learned Advocate for the applicant.
- 3. In the circumstances, S.O. to 13.02.2019 for hearing.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

M.A.509/17 IN O.A.ST.1671/17 WITH M.A.510/17 IN O.A.ST.1672/17 WITH

M.A.511/17 IN O.A.ST.1673/17

(Shri Sambhaji S. Patil & Ors. Vs. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

#### OFFICE ORDER

### ..... TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

\_\_\_\_\_\_

CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN The present case is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of

Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Heard Shri S.K. Chaudhari, learned Advocate holding for Shri N.K. Chaudhari, learned Advocate for the applicants in all these cases and Mrs. Priya R. Bharaswadkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents in all these cases.

2. At the request of learned Advocate for the applicants, S.O. to 07.02.2019 for hearing.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

## ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 741/2018 (Shri Prakash Hiralal Khaparde V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

\_\_\_\_\_ -----

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

**CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN** 

(This matter is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of Division Bench.)

: 03.01.2019 DATE

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Heard Shri S.G. Kulkarni, learned Advocate holding for Shri Ajay S. Deshpande, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

- 2. P.O. files Learned on record copies of communications along with relevant orders received to him from the concerned respondents, which are taken on record and marked as document 'X' collectively for the purpose of identification. She submits that in view of those decisions, nothing survives in the present Original Application.
- 3. Shri Kulkarni, learned Advocate holding for Shri Deshpande, learned Advocate for the applicant, however, submits that decision regarding payment of salary of the suspension period will have to be taken by the concerned respondents.
- In the circumstances, the present Original Application is disposed of without any order as to The concerned respondents are hereby costs. directed to take a suitable decision regarding salary of

# <u>::-2-::</u> O.A. NO. 741/2018

suspension period to the present applicant within the period of 8 weeks from the date of this order and communicate the same to the applicant in writing.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

M.A. 431/2018 IN O.A. 404/2018 (Shri Uddhav G. Gangawane V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN** 

(This matter is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Heard Shri A.D. Gadekar, learned Advocate for the applicant, Shri M.P. Gude, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent nos. 1 to 5 and Shri R.M. Jade, learned Advocate for respondent no. 6.

2. At the request of learned P.O., S.O. to 22.1.2019 for filing affidavit in reply of res. nos. 1 to 5.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

M.A. 490/2018 IN T.A. 5/2017 (W.P. 6554/2017) (Smt. Swati V. Birajdar V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

.\_\_\_\_\_

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN** 

(This matter is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of Division Bench.)

DATE: 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Heard Shri V.B. Wagh, learned Advocate for the applicant and Smt. Priya R. Bharaswadkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

- 2. Issue notices to the respondents in the present Misc. Application, returnable on 6.2.2019.
- 3. Tribunal may take the case for final disposal at once and separate notice for final disposal shall not be issued.
- 4. Applicant is authorized and directed to serve on respondent/s intimation/notice of date of hearing duly authenticated by Registry, along with complete paper book of the case. Respondents are put to notice that the case would be taken up for final disposal at the stage of admission hearing.
- 5. This intimation/notice is ordered under Rule 11 of the Maharashtra Administrative Tribunal (Procedure) Rules, 1988, and the questions such as limitation and alternate remedy are kept open.

## <u>::-2-::</u> <u>M.A. 490/18 IN T.A.</u> 5/17 (W.P. 6554/17)

- 6. The service may be done by hand delivery, speed post, courier and acknowledgment be obtained and produced along with affidavit of compliance in the Registry before due date. Applicant is directed to file affidavit of compliance and notice.
- 7. If notice is not collected within 7 days or proof of service is not produced before 3 days of the next date, case shall automatically stand dismissed without further reference to the Tribunal.
- 8. S.O. to 6.2.2018.
- 9. Steno copy and hamdast allowed for the use of both the sides.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

# ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 300/2015 (Shri Santosh P. Namdas V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN** 

(This matter is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Shri Vinayak A. Tanwade, learned Advocate for the applicant (**absent**). Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, is present.

2. In view of non-availability of the Division Bench, S.O. to 5.2.2019 either for hearing or for passing necessary orders in default in view of order dtd. 11.12.2018.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 512/2015 (Shri Gana L. Pawara V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### OFFICE ORDER

### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN** 

(This matter is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

None appears for the applicant. Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents, is present.

2. In view of non availability of the Division Bench, S.O. to 14.2.2019 for final hearing.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

# ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 832/2016 (Shri Vishal P. Gangawane V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN** 

(This matter is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Heard Shri S.G. Kulkarni, learned Advocate holding for Shri Ajay S. Deshpande, learned Advocate for the applicant, Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondent nos. 1 & 3 and Shri Ashish B. Rajkar, learned Advocate for respondent no. 2.

2. Learned Advocate for the applicant has filed rejoinder. It is taken on record and copy thereof has been served upon the other side. In view of non availability of the Division Bench, S.O. to 5.2.2019 for final hearing.

VICE CHAIRMAN

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NO. 168/2017 (Shri Annarao V. Hivrale V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN** 

(This matter is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Heard Shri S.G. Kulkarni, learned Advocate holding for Shri Ajay S. Deshpande, learned Advocate for the applicant and Shri V.R. Bhumkar, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents.

In view of non availability of the Division Bench,S.O. to 5.2.2019 for final hearing.

**VICE CHAIRMAN** 

ORIGINAL APPLICATION NOS. 492 AND 508/2018 (Shri Arun R. Pawar & Ors. V/s. State of Maharashtra & Ors.)

-----

#### OFFICE ORDER

#### TRIBUNAL'S ORDERS

-----

**CORAM: JUSTICE M.T. JOSHI, VICE CHAIRMAN** 

(This matter is placed before the Single Bench due to non-availability of Division Bench.)

DATE : 03.01.2019

### **ORAL ORDER:**

Shri Atul P. Shejul, learned Advocate for the applicants in both the cases (**absent**). Smt. Deepali S. Deshpande, learned Presenting Officer for the respondents in both the cases is present.

2. In view of non availability of the Division Bench, S.O. to 22.1.2019 for final hearing.

**VICE CHAIRMAN**